

Evaluation of Endothelial Function by Flow-Mediated Dilation: a Comprehensive Review in Rheumatic Disease

Luca Moroni^{1,2} · Carlo Selmi^{3,4} · Claudio Angelini⁵ · Pier Luigi Meroni^{4,6}

Received: 10 October 2016 / Accepted: 3 March 2017 / Published online: 30 March 2017
© L. Hirszfeld Institute of Immunology and Experimental Therapy, Wrocław, Poland 2017

Abstract Flow-mediated dilation (FMD) represents a non-invasive marker of endothelial function to evaluate vascular homeostasis, which reflects the effects of several mechanisms, including vessel tone regulation, cell proliferation, and inflammatory responses. Beyond classical atherosclerotic risk factors such as arterial hypertension, diabetes mellitus, smoking, obesity, and dyslipidemia, chronic inflammation contributes to the endothelial dysfunction causing plaque formation and there is growing evidence of a significantly higher cardiovascular morbidity associated with autoimmune diseases. The endothelium reacts to several endogenous and exogenous stimuli, through surface receptors and intracellular signalling, and releases numerous vasoactive substances, including endothelins, prostacyclins, and nitric oxide (NO). Chronic inflammatory rheumatic diseases are commonly associated with decreased endothelial NO production, vascular damage, and premature atherosclerosis. Despite partially eclipsed by pulse wave velocity measure in the modern scientific literature, we provide a comprehensive overview and critically

discuss the available data supporting FMD as a surrogate marker of endothelial function and, therefore, its potential role in predicting early atherosclerosis in patients with rheumatic diseases.

Keywords Cardiovascular risk · Chronic inflammation · Rheumatoid arthritis · Psoriatic arthritis · Connective tissue disease · Autoantibody

Abbreviations

APS	Anti-phospholipid syndrome
aPL	Anti-phospholipid antibodies
CVD	Cardiovascular disease
EDHF	Endothelium-derived hyperpolarizing factor
eNOS	Endothelial NO synthase
FMD	Flow-mediated dilation
MCTD	Mixed connective tissue disease
MTX	Methotrexate
NO	Nitric oxide
oxLDL	Oxidized low-density lipoproteins
PsA	Psoriatic arthritis
RA	Rheumatoid arthritis
SLE	Systemic lupus erythematosus
SpA	Spondyloarthropathies
SSc	Systemic sclerosis

Introduction

Systemic autoimmune diseases are characterized by the occurrence of premature atherosclerosis and cardiovascular disease, and are associated with vascular damage (Roman et al. 2003; Skeoch and Bruce 2015). The link between atherosclerosis and inflammation is well established and chronic inflammatory diseases share, as a common

✉ Carlo Selmi
carlo.selmi@unimi.it

¹ Department of Internal Medicine, IRCCS Policlinico San Donato, University of Milan, Milan, Italy

² Systemic Autoimmune Diseases Unit, Hospital Clinic, Barcelona, Spain

³ Division of Rheumatology and Clinical Immunology, Humanitas Clinical and Research Center, Via A. Manzoni 56, Rozzano, 20089 Milan, Italy

⁴ University of Milan, Milan, Italy

⁵ Division of Internal Medicine and Nephrology, Humanitas Research Hospital, Milan, Italy

⁶ Rheumatology, Gaetano Pini Hospital, Milan, Italy

pathologic factor, the response to injury process, ultimately leading to endothelial dysfunction (Murdaca et al. 2012). Indeed, accelerated atherosclerosis has been associated with rheumatoid arthritis (RA), systemic lupus erythematosus (SLE), or spondyloarthropathies (SpA), while obliterative vasculopathy may rather be characteristic for systemic sclerosis (SSc) or mixed connective tissue disease (MCTD). Anti-phospholipid antibodies (aPL) have been implicated in vascular injury underlying SLE, primary anti-phospholipid syndrome, RA, and MCTD. A great variability is seen also in the biohumoral profile with respect to risk factors. Nitric oxide (NO), released from the endothelium in response to increased shear-stress and certain pharmacologic stimuli, may work as an endogenous antiatherogenic molecule by maintaining low arterial tone at rest, inhibiting leukocyte-endothelial interactions, attenuating platelet aggregation, and inhibiting smooth-muscle cell proliferation (Celermajer 1997). Aging, diabetes, dyslipidemia, and hypertension are characterized by reduced NO availability and by the production by the endothelium, as a compensatory mechanism, of endothelium-derived hyperpolarizing factor (EDHF), which has a vasodilating effect mediated by hyperpolarization of vascular smooth-muscle cell (Taddei et al. 1999). The reduction of NO availability, furthermore, interferes with the mobilization of circulating endothelial progenitor cells (EPCs), an alternative mechanism for maintenance and repair of the endothelium (Op den Buijs et al. 2004). EPCs are peripheral blood mononuclear cells derived from different tissues, expressing cell surface markers that are similar to mature endothelial cells. The discovery of EPCs has led to new insights in vascular repair and atherosclerosis, and also produced a new hypothesis for immunological aging. EPCs from the bone marrow contribute to vascular repair by migrating to distant vessels to differentiate into mature endothelial cells and replace old and injured endothelial cells. The ability of EPCs to repair vascular damage depends on their number and functionality. Thus, such mechanisms may be impaired in patients with classical cardiovascular risk factors (Altabas et al. 2016) and significant abnormalities in the number and function of these cells were reported in patients with RA and SLE. Inflammatory cytokines including interferon- α and tumor necrosis factor (TNF)- α are capable to impair EPCs function *ex vivo* and may, therefore, contribute to the elevated cardiovascular disease (CVD) risk in these patients (Reynolds et al. 2014).

Endothelial dysfunction is a widely used term to describe any form of abnormal functional and reversible alteration based on endothelial cells, leading to an abnormal response to physiological stimuli and to a shift of the actions of the endothelium toward reduced vasodilation, proinflammatory state, and proliferative and prothrombotic properties (Daiber et al. 2016).

Endothelial dysfunction, especially the reduction in the bioavailability of endothelium-derived NO, is a key early event in atherogenesis, appearing long before the formation of structural atherosclerotic changes (Celermajer et al. 1992). The increased expression of adhesion molecules, proinflammatory cytokines, prothrombotic factors, oxidative stress upregulation, and abnormal vascular tone modulation are the main factors involved in this “atherogenic cascade” (Murdaca et al. 2012).

The most widely used and validated technique for measuring endothelial function is based on flow-mediated dilation (FMD) (Celermajer et al. 1992; Peretz et al. 2007). It is a non-invasive method introduced in 1992 (Celermajer et al. 1992) that consists in studying flow-mediated changes in the brachial artery diameter. Flow-mediated changes in conduit artery diameter are caused by shear-stress induced generation of endothelial derived vasoactive mediators, in particular NO. Since the arterial dilator response to shear-stress can be almost completely blocked by pre-treatment with NO synthase inhibitors (Joannides et al. 1995), it has been suggested that the phenomenon is predominantly due to endothelial release of this molecule (Raitakari and Celermajer 2000). Indeed, Endothelium-independent dilator response can be tested by low-dose sublingual nitroglycerin (Ghiadoni et al. 2001). The endothelial state of activation, assessed by this method, significantly correlates with the results of more invasive coronary functional tests representing the gold standard (Takase et al. 1998) and strongly predicts future cardiovascular events. Median FMD was the best independent predictor of long-term cardiovascular adverse events in a cohort of 618 consecutive healthy subjects with no apparent heart disease (Shechter et al. 2014).

FMD has been studied widely in clinical research as it enables serial evaluation of young subjects, including children. It also permits testing of lifestyle and pharmacological interventions on endothelial biology at an early preclinical stage, when the disease process is most likely to be reversible (Deanfield et al. 2007). However, some practical challenges need to be overcome before this technique becomes suitable for use in routine clinical practice (Corretti et al. 2002; Deanfield et al. 2007). These challenges include the need for trained operators, the cost of the equipment and also the care required to minimize the effect of environmental or physiological influences. It is important to note that technical variations, such as the position of the occluding cuff and duration of the inflation, may produce results that are less representative of local NO activity, since FMD is determined, in part, also by the magnitude of post-ischemic forearm vasodilation, which is a measure of microcirculatory function. Finally, due to the variability and degree of response, large study populations are required for clinical studies (Ghiadoni et al. 2008).

Atherosclerosis and Immune Mechanisms

An alteration of the endothelial function is an early marker of atherosclerosis, also contributing to the development of atherosclerotic lesions and later clinical complications (Ghiadoni et al. 2008). Early in the development of atherosclerosis, low-density-lipoprotein cholesterol becomes oxidized, which results in endothelial cell dysfunction and the expression of vascular cell adhesion molecules and chemokines. In response to these adhesion molecules, monocytes are recruited; these differentiate into macrophages and endocytose (through interactions with scavenger receptors) into the vessel wall. These macrophages then take up oxidized low-density-lipoprotein cholesterol and become foam cells, which subsequently produce growth factors and cytokines that lead to the proliferation of vascular smooth-muscle cells and the development of plaques. T cells, predominantly type 1 T-helper lymphocytes, are also recruited to the subendothelial space where they produce cytokines that can promote a systemic inflammatory response. The lipoproteins are often associated with proteoglycan molecules in the extracellular space of the intima (Sherer and Shoenfeld 2006).

The endothelium is a large paracrine organ that regulates the vascular tone, cell growth, platelet/leukocyte interactions, and thrombogenicity (Corretti et al. 2002). It synthesizes at least three different vasodilator factors: i.e., NO, prostacyclin, and EDHF. However, under several pathological conditions, vasoconstricting factors, including endothelin, superoxide, and vasoconstrictor prostaglandins can be produced by endothelium, as well. Animal and human studies have demonstrated that several mechanisms are involved in endothelial dysfunction in atherosclerosis (Dhawan et al. 2005; Hathaway et al. 2002; Li et al. 2015; Maas et al. 2008; Orlandi et al. 2006; Tabas et al. 2015; Vanhoutte et al. 2009), including a reduced or impaired endothelial signal transduction, the reduced availability of L-arginine, the reduced endothelial NO synthase (eNOS) expression, reduced co-factors for eNOS, NO inactivation increased by superoxide anion derived from macrophages, concomitant release of endothelium-derived contracting factors, intimal thickening, and smooth-muscle vascular response. eNOS is one of three enzymatic isoforms that synthesize NO, a small gaseous and lipophilic molecule that is primarily responsible for the generation of NO in the vascular endothelium. NO produced by eNOS in the vascular endothelium plays a crucial role in regulating vascular tone, cellular proliferation, leukocyte adhesion, and platelet aggregation (Forstermann and Munzel 2006). Therefore, a functional eNOS is essential for a healthy cardiovascular system and eNOS pathophysiology is the key topic to understand how endothelial dysfunction results in FMD reduction.

Atherosclerosis may result from systemic and/or local vascular inflammation also in non-rheumatic diseases, but a more pronounced chronic inflammatory infiltration in media and inner adventitia was found in specimens from patients with inflammatory rheumatic diseases (Hollan et al. 2007). Moreover, higher level of pentraxin 3, a key component of innate immunity and novel biomarker of inflammation, was found in patients sera with coronary artery disease associated to inflammatory arthritides (Hollan et al. 2010).

Inflammatory mechanisms leading to atherosclerosis are intricate and quite specific of disease spectrum. Cytokines, such as TNF- α or interleukin 6, and immune complexes are mainly involved in arthritides, such as RA, SpA, as well as in SLE. On the other hand, specific autoantibodies including anti-oxidized-low-density lipoproteins (oxLDL), anti-cardiolipin, and anti- β 2-glycoprotein (anti- β 2-GPI) are rather involved in SLE- and anti-phospholipid syndrome (APS)-related vascular disease (Soltesz et al. 2011). The most important cytokines involved in atherosclerosis are summarized in Table 1. β 2-GPI inhibits oxLDL engulfment via scavenger receptors, but if bound to oxidized forms of cholesteryl linoleate on LDL can be recognized by anti- β 2-GPI antibodies and the complexes uptaken by macrophages via the Fc- γ receptors (Matsuura et al. 2002). Not only oxLDL but also high-density lipoproteins (HDL) may be detrimental by losing their athero-protective properties in case of qualitative modifications and turning to proinflammatory HDL. These macromolecular changes can actually cause increased oxidation of LDL as seen in 45% of women with SLE compared to 20% of RA and 4% of controls (McMahon et al. 2006; Watanabe et al. 2012). Moreover, in a study by Ronda et al. (2012), impairment of serum capacity to promote cholesterol efflux from macrophages shows different patterns in RA and SLE, not only demonstrating a dysfunction and loss of athero-protective activity of HDL, but also pointing to the existence of specific underlying mechanisms in each disease, possibly beyond inflammation and correlating with disease activity (Rader 2006).

FMD Measurement Tools

The measure of the target artery diameter is obtained by high-resolution vascular ultrasonography in response to an increase in blood flow, causing shear-stress, during reactive hyperemia (Joannides et al. 1995). Numerous factors affect flow-mediated vascular reactivity, including temperature, food, drugs, and sympathetic stimuli, among others. Therefore, subjects should fast for at least 8–12 h before the study, and they should be studied in a quiet, temperature-controlled room. All vasoactive medications should be withheld for at least four half-lives, if possible. In addition,

Table 1 Cytokines involved in atherosclerosis

Cytokine	Expressed by	Induced by	Receptor(s)	Target cells	Biological function	Evidence for role in atherosclerosis	References
TNF- α	Endothelial cells T cells B cells Monocytes Foam cells Mesenchymal cells	LPS IFN- γ Inhibited by HDL	TNFR1 (inflammatory) TNFR2 (apoptotic)	Neutrophils NK cells T cells Fibroblasts Macrophages	Activates endothelium Activates macrophages Increases adhesion molecules Increases SAA Increases MCP-1	Increased TNF- α levels increase ATH risk	Barter et al. (2004), Ponthieux et al. (2004)
IL-1	Monocytes Macrophages Foam cells	LPS TNF- α Inhibited by HDL	IL-1R1 IL-1R2 IL-1ra (natural antagonist)	T cells Fibroblasts Macrophages	Activates macrophages Increases adhesion molecules Increases SAA Increases MCP-1 Drives angiogenesis	Increased IL-1 levels increase ATH risk	Astry et al. (2013), Barter et al. (2004), Brennan et al. (1989), Ponthieux et al. (2004), Schurgers et al. (2011)
IL-6	T cells B cells Mesenchymal cells Smooth-muscle cells Macrophages Endothelial cells	IL-1	Gp130 IL-6R	T cells B cells Macrophages Chondrocytes	Autoantibody production Induces acute phase proteins	Plaque development Plaque destabilisation	Astry et al. (2013), Schuett et al. (2009)
IFN- γ	T cells NK cells Foam cells	Viral RNA T cells	IFN- γ R	T cells B cells	Th1 differentiation Inhibits SMCs, ECs, collagen, LPL Increases plaque instability Increases TNF- α , IL-1 Primes macrophages for activation Increase CD40L	Increases IFN- γ in unstable angina	Fernandes et al. (2004), Hansson (2001), Schurgers et al. (2011), Szabo et al. (2003)
IL-12	Macrophages Smooth-muscle cells Endothelial cells	LPS CD40 IFN- γ OxLDL	IL-12R	Macrophages NK cells T cells	Th1 differentiation Increases IFN- γ production	Increased levels observed in ATH plaques	Fernandes et al. (2004), Ueyamura et al. (1996)

IFN interferon, IL interleukin, ATH atherosclerosis, SAA serum amyloid A, MCP-1 monocyte chemoattractant protein-1, LPS lipopolysaccharide, SMC smooth-muscle cells, ECs endothelial cells, LPL lipoprotein lipase

subjects should not exercise, which should not ingest substances that might affect FMD such as caffeine, high-fat foods, and vitamin C or use tobacco for at least 4–6 h before the study (Corretti et al. 2002). The investigator should be cognizant of the phase of the subject's menstrual cycle, as it too may affect FMD (Hashimoto et al. 1995).

The subject is supine with the arm in a comfortable position for adequate imaging of the brachial artery above the antecubital fossa on the longitudinal plane. A segment with clear anterior and posterior intimal interfaces between the lumen and vessel wall is selected for continuous 2D grayscale imaging (Corretti et al. 2002). When

a sphygmomanometer cuff placed on the forearm distal to the brachial artery is inflated to 200 mmHg and subsequently released 5 min later, FMD occurs as a result of local endothelial release of NO (Ghiadoni et al. 2007; Joannides et al. 1995). The artery diameter is measured on two phases: at baseline and during reactive hyperaemia. It is possible to finally get a third-phase imaging after administration of sublingual nitroglycerin using a normal antianginal dose of 400 μ g (which causes endothelium-independent smooth-muscle-mediated vasodilation) (Raitakari and Celermajer 2000). The cuff inflation period of 5 min was initially decided to produce adequate hyperaemia and to allow

FMD, but not to compromise patient comfort. Shorter inflation periods do not seem to produce significant FMD (Corretti et al. 1995).

A B-mode ultrasound image of the brachial artery is obtained, with focus of the near wall (Celermajer et al. 1992). Ultrasound transducers with a frequency of 7.0 MHz or greater should be used. The ideal vessel size is 2.5–5.0 mm (90% of the brachial arteries among adult population). Most investigators have found this technique accurate and reproducible (Leeson et al. 1997; Sorensen et al. 1995; Uehata et al. 1997), although some groups have reported poor inter-operator comparability (Hardie et al. 1997). With regard to the problem of FMD normal range, a rigorous meta-regression by Bots et al. (2005), comprehensive of 219 papers, 412 study groups and 16,680 subjects, found a FMD mean value of $6.4 \pm 3.6\%$ for healthy subjects.

As a matter of fact, mean FMD differs widely between studies and there is a great overlap between populations (healthy, chronic heart disease, and diabetics), owing to technical different aspects of the measurements, location, and duration of the occlusion. However, as seen in the following paragraphs, clinical significance of FMD arises interestingly if intra-population and case–control differences are considered.

FMD and Atherosclerosis in Autoimmune Diseases

Risk of cardiovascular events has been found to be increased in many autoimmune rheumatological diseases and especially in RA (Jacobsson et al. 1993; Liang et al. 2006; Turesson et al. 2007), SLE (Bertoli et al. 2006b; Erkan 2006; Manzi et al. 1997) and APS (Meroni et al. 2007; Vaarala et al. 1995). Since this was demonstrated, flow-mediated dilatation has been studied also in this setting (Cugno et al. 2010; Stamatelopoulos et al. 2009) and demonstrated to be a reliable marker of endothelial function (Soltesz et al. 2009). Detection of early endothelial dysfunction in this selected population may have a beneficial role in preventing cardiovascular events, to date, the leading cause of death in the Western World (Doria et al. 2005; Shoenfeld et al. 2005).

Our literature review was conducted to verify if FMD can be a reliable method to assess preclinical atherosclerosis in systemic autoimmune diseases. Structured literature searches were done from June 2015 and subsequently updated until November 2016 in PubMed/Medline database, using the following medical subject headings (MeSH): autoimmune diseases, rheumatic diseases, RA, psoriatic arthritis (PsA), SLE, anti-phospholipid (syndrome), and SSc, combined with “flow-mediated dilatation”, which is not included in MeSH database. Titles and

abstracts were screened to determine if they were potentially relevant. Included in the review were both cross-sectional and interventional studies either comparatively assessing FMD in rheumatic patients and healthy controls or evaluating its changes after treatment. Articles not concerning rheumatic diseases, editorials, and articles in languages other than English or involving children were excluded.

RA and PsA

RA is a chronic autoimmune disease characterized by persistent synovitis, systemic inflammation, and autoantibodies (particularly to rheumatoid factor and citrullinated peptide) (Scott et al. 2010).

RA represents the “model disease” when talking about atherosclerosis and autoimmunity like a two-faced coin. From a biological point of view, B cells and citrullinate proteins are found in the adventitia infiltrates only in RA atherosclerotic patients (Sokolove et al. 2013). Cardiovascular disease accounts for 30–50% of deaths in patients with RA (DeMaria 2002; Kitas and Erb 2003) and the magnitude of cardiovascular risk in RA is comparable to that of diabetes mellitus (Peters et al. 2009). Significant RA-related risk factors for cardiovascular death are the total inflammatory burden, presence of vasculitis, and lung disease (Maradit-Kremers et al. 2005).

The decreased endothelium-dependent macrovascular function, assessed with FMD, appears to be evident within 1 year of RA diagnosis, but does not appear to be further influenced by disease duration (Van Doornum et al. 2003; Vaudo et al. 2004). Chatterjee Adhikari et al. (2012) more recently confirmed the association between subclinical atherosclerosis and early RA. A positive association between disease activity using erythrocyte sedimentation rate, C-reactive protein and Disease Activity Score (DAS-28) and FMD in RA, was described in higher quality studies (Arosio et al. 2007; Pingiotti et al. 2007; Vaudo et al. 2004). The association was not recapitulated by other groups, whose data were not fully shown in the paper (Sodergren et al. 2010; Van Doornum et al. 2003). A positive correlation of FMD with rheumatoid factor was also reported (Chatterjee Adhikari et al. 2012) as well as with the HLA-DRB1*04 shared epitope (Gonzalez-Juanatey et al. 2003), while an inverse correlation with the CCR5Δ32 polymorphism was reported (Rodriguez-Rodriguez et al. 2011). This latter association suggests the potential role of genetic susceptibility in facilitating inflammation-related cardiovascular morbidity.

Treatments may play a role in both increasing and preventing cardiovascular morbidity. Nonsteroidal anti-inflammatory drugs and cyclooxygenase (COX)-2 selective inhibitors in particular can worsen endothelial function

by producing the well-known prostaglandin/thromboxane mismatch (Hawkey 2001) leading to a higher thrombosis risk (Mukherjee et al. 2001). However, FMD is unlikely to be affected by COX-1 and COX-2 inhibition (Wong et al. 2007).

In addition, corticosteroids increase cardiovascular risk with a dose-related profile (del Rincon et al. 2004) by their action on arterial pressure, glycaemia control, weight gain, and lipid balance. However, Veselinovic et al. (2012) demonstrate that RA patients who used low doses of corticosteroids have, statistically, significantly better FMD, than those steroid-free. This would be related to better control of inflammation in treated patients, with limited side effects of small doses of corticosteroids.

Disease-modifying antirheumatic drugs significantly improve FMD in a 1-year noncontrolled follow-up study (Guin et al. 2013). Despite the concerns about homocysteine production (Landewe et al. 2000), methotrexate (MTX) reduces overall mortality and cardiovascular risk in RA (Choi et al. 2002; Krause et al. 2000), and the same for sulphasalazine and hydroxychloroquine (van Halm et al. 2006). Folate supplementation during MTX appears to have no effect on cardiovascular mortality. No data about leflunomide are available, probably due to its second-line therapy profile.

Myocardial infarction and stroke risk are affected by biological therapies (Nadareishvili et al. 2008; Weisman et al. 2007), likely by improving endothelial function with FMD improvement as observed with rituximab (Gonzalez-Juanatey et al. 2008; Hsue et al. 2014), tocilizumab (Protogerou et al. 2011), and anti-TNF- α (Bilsborough et al. 2006; Hurlimann et al. 2002; Kerekes et al. 2011), in this last case likely with a sustained effect (Capria et al. 2010; Sidiropoulos et al. 2009) or transitory during the loading phase of therapy, suggesting an enhanced and persistent TNF generation within the arterial wall (Bosello et al. 2008; Gonzalez-Juanatey et al. 2004). No data on abatacept are available.

PsA is a multigenic autoimmune disease that involves synovial tissue, enthesal sites, and skin, and that may result in significant joint damage (Fitzgerald and Winchester 2009). An increased cardiovascular morbidity and mortality is reported in patients with PsA as well (Gladman et al. 2009; Li et al. 2012). Endothelial dysfunction and subclinical atherosclerosis seem to underlie this association also in the absence of an overt cardiovascular disease (Gonzalez-Juanatey et al. 2007). In several reports, a lower FMD was found in patients compared to controls (Contessa et al. 2009; Di Minno et al. 2015; Garg et al. 2016; Yilmazer et al. 2015). As in RA, also in PsA, there are concerns about the long-term response to TNF- α blockers on endothelial dysfunction via FMD assessment (Mazzocchi et al. 2010; Ramonda et al. 2014). Ustekinumab appears

to be neutral on cardiovascular risk despite there may be a long-term effect (Hugh et al. 2014), but there are no data of its influence on endothelial function. No data on possible athero-protective effects of apremilast are available yet.

SLE and APS

SLE is a pleomorphic condition with features ranging from skin rash and arthritis through anaemia and thrombocytopenia to serositis, nephritis, and neurological signs and symptoms (Rahman and Isenberg 2008). Atherosclerosis occurs prematurely in SLE and is independent of classical Framingham risk factors. The clinical profile of patients with SLE and atherosclerosis suggests a role for disease-related factors in atherogenesis (Roman et al. 2003). Heightened endothelial cell apoptosis may represent a common pathway for abnormal vascular function and thrombosis propensity (Rajagopalan et al. 2004).

The risk of thrombosis for a patient with SLE is significantly higher than for the general population, especially in the first year from diagnosis and cardiovascular events accounts for one-third of deaths in SLE. The inflammatory burden, the presence of renal disease, vasculitis, aPL positivity, and high-dose corticosteroids are further risk factors in this setting (Bertoli et al. 2006a; Erkan 2006).

APS may cause venous, arterial and small-vessel thrombosis, pregnancy loss and preterm delivery for patients with severe pre-eclampsia or placental insufficiency. Other clinical manifestations are cardiac livedo reticularis, heart valvular disease, microthrombotic nephropathy, thrombocytopenia, haemolytic anaemia, and cognitive impairment. aPL promote activation of endothelial cells, monocytes, and platelets in addition to overproduction of tissue factor and thromboxane A2 (Ruiz-Irastorza et al. 2010).

The link between arterial thrombotic events and aPL has widely been established by Euro-phospholipid Project (Cervera et al. 2002, 2015) in a cohort of 1000 patients. In this study population, the prevalence of stroke was 13.1%, myocardial infarction 2.8%, TIA 7%, and amaurosis fugax 2.8%. Smaller studies confirmed this strong association with micro- and macrovascular morbidity (Brey et al. 2001; Meroni et al. 2007). Furthermore, the presence of aPL has been associated also with accelerated atherosclerosis (Pierangeli et al. 2008) inducing a proinflammatory and procoagulant phenotype and cross reacting with oxLDL in SLE-related APS (Vaarala et al. 1993). Moreover, immunolocalizing of β 2-GPI I in atherosclerotic plaques and β 2-GPI-reacting T cells suggest this further mechanism of disease in humans (Conti et al. 2014; George et al. 1999; Tincani et al. 1996). However, Roman et al. (2003) and other groups revealed, in clinical studies, the absence of association between aPL positivity and plaque formation

in SLE patients compared to primary APS (Manzi et al. 1999).

The FMD percent was significantly lower in adults with SLE compared to controls in many studies (Wang et al. 2014) and appears to be related to the total antioxidant status (Sincer et al. 2015), myocardial diastolic function (Chin et al. 2014) and vascular atherosclerotic complications (Kiss et al. 2006). Significant differences were also found in SLE patients with and without nephritis, showing lower FMD in nephritis group, whereas no difference in carotid-intima-media thickness was reported (Sharma et al. 2016). It is outstanding that disease-related risk factors might be counterbalanced by the traditional cardio-protective behaviours like physical activity without worsening disease activity (dos Reis-Neto et al. 2013).

FMD supported early onset of subclinical atherosclerosis in APS (Cugno et al. 2010; Mercanoglu et al. 2004; Stalc et al. 2011) with only one case–control study on 20 patients by Gresele et al. (2009) not confirming the association between aPL positivity and endothelial dysfunction.

In nearly all studies (Kosch et al. 2003), cyclosporine and other calcineurin inhibitors have demonstrated to ameliorate FMD in renal transplantation recipients (Akoglu et al. 2013), and the same for sirolimus and mycophenolate (Joannides et al. 2010), but no data of such treatment regimens in SLE are available. Similarly, there are no data about FMD changes with azathioprine, cyclophosphamide, or belimumab in SLE.

Systemic Sclerosis

Systemic sclerosis (SSc) is a complex disease in which extensive fibrosis, vascular alterations, and autoantibodies against various cellular antigens are among the main hallmarks (Gabrielli et al. 2009). Accelerated atherosclerosis has been described in patients with SSc and this occurred despite of the absence of classical vascular risk factors (Cerinic et al. 2003). Whether endothelial dysfunction at a macrovascular level is present in very early stages of SSc remain uncertain (Domsic et al. 2014; Rollando et al. 2010; Roustit et al. 2008), but FMD is reduced in correlation with disease duration and capillaroscopic damage progression (Rosato et al. 2013). In addition to blunted peripheral vascular reactivity and endothelial function, patients with SSc have significantly smaller brachial artery diameter compared to healthy controls and FMD is associated with digital ulcers development (Frech et al. 2015) and recurrence (Silva et al. 2015). Pulmonary arterial hypertension is predicted by low FMD in limited cutaneous SSc but not in diffuse cutaneous SSc (Frech et al. 2015; Takahashi et al. 2014).

Assessment of FMD in the pre-atherosclerotic stage may have a beneficial diagnostic, prognostic, and therapeutic

relevance (Szucs et al. 2007). Endothelial dysfunction and reduced FMD are associated with prostanoid cyclic therapy. This effect occurs together with a concomitant increase in expired NO, suggesting its direct positive influence on endothelial function. It may also partially explain the clinical beneficial effect of this treatment in SSc (Giannattasio et al. 2007). An improvement of FMD in SSc patients after therapy with bosentan has also been described (Sfikakis et al. 2007), while neither data on macitentan nor riociguat and FMD are available. Only in one small case series of two patients, a benefit of cyclophosphamide pulses was demonstrated on endothelial function in parallel with improvement of SSc-related interstitial lung disease (Takahashi et al. 2012).

Concluding Remarks

Prevention of CVD requires risk stratification and treatment of classical risk factors, such as smoking, hypertension, hypercholesterolemia, and diabetes. Nevertheless, classic risk stratification might be not sufficient in the presence of a non-modifiable factor like a chronic inflammatory disease.

Several vascular markers obtained by ultrasound and other non-invasive techniques have been proposed for this aim (Bruno et al. 2014). Although greater evidence is becoming available for other vascular functional tests like pulse wave velocity (Ben-Shlomo et al. 2014) and carotid-intima-media thickness measurement (O'Leary and Bots 2010), FMD may be most cost-effective to stratify rheumatic patients based on their cardiovascular risk. Standardization is, however, the ultimate factor when using this method that is operator-dependent and affected by many non-disease-related factors. In chronic rheumatic diseases, FMD appears as a useful and reliable technique to assess endothelial function and to predict atherosclerosis and cardiovascular risk that is, to date, the first cause of morbidity and mortality in these patients. It is then of paramount importance to better define long-term disease-related prognostic factors, being autoimmune diseases increasingly curable nowadays.

As seen in Table 2, mean or median FMD shows a considerable variation among different settings and study populations (range 3.2–11.0%), but shows an almost universal significance in defining case/control differences in assessing the treatment outcome. Moreover, it well correlates with undebated atherosclerosis predictors like carotid artery intima-media thickness as seen in RA (Veselinovic et al. 2012) and SLE (El-Magadmi et al. 2004).

FMD resulted, therefore, a good surrogate marker of chronic vascular injury in autoimmune rheumatic

Table 2 Available reports on FMD in rheumatological disorders

Disease	References	N	FMD	Comments
Rheumatoid arthritis	Hurlimann et al. (2002)	11	Mean baseline 3.2%, SEM 0.4% After 12 weeks of anti-TNF- α 4.1%, SEM 0.5% ($p=0.018$)	Slight improvement after anti-TNF
	Van Doornum et al. (2003)	25	Mean RA 7.6%, SD 4.6% control 8.5%, SD 4.1% ($p=0.49$)	No statistically significant difference between RA and control group; reduced brachial artery compliance
	Vaudo et al. (2004)	32	Mean RA 3.2%, SD 1.3% control 5.7%, SD 2.0% ($p<0.001$)	Early onset patients
	Bilsborough et al. (2006)	14	Mean baseline 6.5%, SEM 1.4% After 36 weeks of anti-TNF- α 8.6%, SEM 1.5% ($p=0.009$)	Improvement after anti-TNF
	Arosio et al. (2007)	65	Mean RA 8.2%, SD 2.0% control 11.5%, SD 3% ($p<0.05$)	FMD correlated with CRP
	Gonzalez-Juanatey et al. (2008)	6	Mean baseline 3.35%, SD 1.58% After 2 week of RTX 7.02% SD 2.31% ($p=0.03$)	FMD improved after rituximab
	Veselinovic et al. (2012)	52	Mean RA 9.16%, SD 7.03% control 12.60%, SD 5.49% ($p=0.005$)	Better FMD with lower dose corticosteroids
	Chatterjee Adhikari et al. (2012)	35	Mean RA 5.26% (2.9–10.6%) control 10.34% (7.4–14.3%) ($p=0.004$)	Early arthritis. FMD correlates with RF
Psoriatic arthritis	Yilmazer et al. (2015)	20	Mean PsA 11.0%, range 8.0–15.0% control 13.2%, range (8.1, 17.6%) ($p=0.01$)	
	Garg et al. (2016)	16	Mean PsA 6.3%, SD 0.95% control 9.3%, SD 1.4% ($p=0.01$)	Inversely correlates with c-IMT
Systemic lupus erythematosus	El-Magadmi et al. (2004)	62	Median SLE 3.6%, range (−6.3, +13.7) control 6.9%, range (−6.6, +17.8%) ($p=0.001$)	FMD negatively correlates with carotid artery IMT
	Kiss et al. (2006)	61	Mean SLE, CV ⁺ 5.54%, SD 4.36% SLE, CV [−] 8.81%, SD 5.28% ($p=0.01$)	Significant difference between SLE patients with and without cardiovascular complications
	Sincer et al. (2015)	34	Mean SLE 8.1%, SD 4.9% control 10.6%, SD 4.7% ($p=0.04$)	Correlated with total antioxidant status

Table 2 (continued)

Disease	References	N	FMD	Comments
Anti-phospholipid syndrome	Cugno et al. (2010)	40	Mean APS 5.59%, SD 2.46% control 8.19%, SD 2.58% ($p=0.0001$)	Correlated with soluble markers of endothelial dysfunction
Systemic sclerosis	Szucs et al. (2007)	29	Mean SSc 4.82%, SD 3.76% control 8.86%, SD 3.56% ($p<0.001$)	
	Frech et al. (2015)	38	Mean SSc 5.23%, SEM 0.22% control 8.69%, SEM 0.21% ($p<0.001$)	Correlated with development of digital ulcers
	Silva et al. (2015)	77	FMD (AUC 0.754, 95%CI 0.643–0.864)	Independently correlated with digital ulcer development and recurrence

CRP C-reactive protein, C-IMT carotid-intima-media thickness measurement, CV cardiovascular, AUC area under the curve, RTX rituximab

diseases for both predicting cardiovascular morbidity and to evaluate treatment efficacy.

The effect of old and new immune modulating therapies on atherosclerosis is a critical field of interest for rheumatologists and immunologists, and warrants further research, particularly in the wide-spreading era of the new biological agents.

Compliance with ethical standards

Conflict of interest The authors declare no conflicts of interest in relation to the presented work.

References

- Akoglu H, Seringec N, Yildirim T et al (2013) Relationship between hemorheology and endothelial dysfunction in renal transplant patients receiving calcineurin inhibitors. *J Nephrol* 26:931–940
- Altabas V, Altabas K, Kirigin L (2016) Endothelial progenitor cells (EPCs) in ageing and age-related diseases: How currently available treatment modalities affect EPC biology, atherosclerosis, and cardiovascular outcomes. *Mech Ageing Dev* 159:49–62
- Arosio E, De Marchi S, Rigoni A et al (2007) Forearm haemodynamics, arterial stiffness and microcirculatory reactivity in rheumatoid arthritis. *J Hypertens* 25:1273–1278
- Astry B, Venkatesha SH, Moudgil KD (2013) Temporal cytokine expression and the target organ attributes unravel novel aspects of autoimmune arthritis. *Indian J Med Res* 138:717–731
- Barter PJ, Nicholls S, Rye KA et al (2004) Antiinflammatory properties of HDL. *Circ Res* 95:764–772
- Ben-Shlomo Y, Spears M, Boustred C et al (2014) Aortic pulse wave velocity improves cardiovascular event prediction: an individual participant meta-analysis of prospective observational data from 17,635 subjects. *J Am Coll Cardiol* 63:636–646
- Bertoli AM, Alarcon GS, Calvo-Alen J et al (2006a) Systemic lupus erythematosus in a multiethnic US cohort. XXXIII. Clinical [corrected] features, course, and outcome in patients with late-onset disease. *Arthritis Rheum* 54:1580–1587
- Bertoli AM, Fernandez M, McGwin G Jr et al (2006b) Association of antioxygenized low-density lipoprotein antibodies with vascular arterial events and renal manifestations in systemic lupus erythematosus patients: comment on the article by Frostegard et al. *Arthritis Rheum* 54:2035–2036
- Bilsborough W, Keen H, Taylor A et al (2006) Anti-tumour necrosis factor- α therapy over conventional therapy improves endothelial function in adults with rheumatoid arthritis. *Rheumatol Int* 26:1125–1131
- Bosello S, Santoliquido A, Zoli A et al (2008) TNF- α blockade induces a reversible but transient effect on endothelial dysfunction in patients with long-standing severe rheumatoid arthritis. *Clin Rheumatol* 27:833–839
- Bots ML, Westerink J, Rabelink TJ et al (2005) Assessment of flow-mediated vasodilatation (FMD) of the brachial artery: effects of technical aspects of the FMD measurement on the FMD response. *Eur Heart J* 26:363–368
- Brennan FM, Chantry D, Jackson A et al (1989) Inhibitory effect of TNF α antibodies on synovial cell interleukin-1 production in rheumatoid arthritis. *Lancet* 2:244–247
- Brey RL, Abbott RD, Curb JD et al (2001) beta(2)-Glycoprotein 1-dependent anticardiolipin antibodies and risk of ischemic stroke and myocardial infarction: the Honolulu heart program. *Stroke* 32:1701–1706
- Bruno RM, Bianchini E, Fajta F et al (2014) Intima media thickness, pulse wave velocity, and flow mediated dilation. *Cardiovasc Ultrasound* 12:34
- Capria A, De Nardo D, Baffetti FR et al (2010) Long-term anti-TNF- α treatments reverse the endothelial dysfunction in rheumatoid arthritis: the biological coherence between synovial and endothelial inflammation. *Int J Immunopathol Pharmacol* 23:255–262
- Celermajer DS (1997) Endothelial dysfunction: does it matter? Is it reversible? *J Am Coll Cardiol* 30:325–333
- Celermajer DS, Sorensen KE, Gooch VM et al (1992) Non-invasive detection of endothelial dysfunction in children and adults at risk of atherosclerosis. *The Lancet* 340:1111–1115
- Cerini MM, Valentini G, Sorano GG et al (2003) Blood coagulation, fibrinolysis, and markers of endothelial dysfunction in systemic sclerosis. *Semin Arthritis Rheum* 32:285–295
- Cervera R, Piette JC, Font J et al (2002) Antiphospholipid syndrome: clinical and immunologic manifestations and patterns

- of disease expression in a cohort of 1,000 patients. *Arthritis Rheum* 46:1019–1027
- Cervera R, Serrano R, Pons-Estel GJ et al (2015) Morbidity and mortality in the antiphospholipid syndrome during a 10-year period: a multicentre prospective study of 1000 patients. *Ann Rheum Dis* 74:1011–1018
- Chatterjee Adhikari M, Guin A, Chakraborty S et al (2012) Subclinical atherosclerosis and endothelial dysfunction in patients with early rheumatoid arthritis as evidenced by measurement of carotid intima-media thickness and flow-mediated vasodilatation: an observational study. *Semin Arthritis Rheum* 41:669–675
- Chin CW, Chin CY, Ng MX et al (2014) Endothelial function is associated with myocardial diastolic function in women with systemic lupus erythematosus. *Rheumatol Int* 34:1281–1285
- Choi HK, Hernan MA, Seeger JD et al (2002) Methotrexate and mortality in patients with rheumatoid arthritis: a prospective study. *Lancet* 359:1173–1177
- Contessa C, Ramonda R, Lo Nigro A et al (2009) [Subclinical atherosclerosis in patients with psoriatic arthritis: a case-control study. Preliminary data]. *Reumatismo* 61:298–305
- Conti F, Spinelli FR, Alessandri C et al (2014) Subclinical atherosclerosis in systemic lupus erythematosus and antiphospholipid syndrome: focus on beta2GPI-specific T cell response. *Arterioscler Thromb Vasc Biol* 34:661–668
- Corretti MC, Plotnick GD, Vogel RA (1995) Technical aspects of evaluating brachial artery vasodilatation using high-frequency ultrasound. *Am J Physiol* 268(4 Pt):H1397–H1404
- Corretti MC, Anderson TJ, Benjamin EJ et al (2002) Guidelines for the ultrasound assessment of endothelial-dependent flow-mediated vasodilation of the brachial artery: a report of the International Brachial Artery Reactivity Task Force. *J Am Coll Cardiol* 39:257–265
- Cugno M, Borghi MO, Lonati LM et al (2010) Patients with antiphospholipid syndrome display endothelial perturbation. *J Autoimmun* 34:105–110
- Daiber A, Steven S, Weber A et al (2016) Targeting vascular (endothelial) dysfunction. *Br J Pharmacol*. doi:[10.1111/bph.13517](https://doi.org/10.1111/bph.13517)
- Deanfield JE, Halcox JP, Rabelink TJ (2007) Endothelial function and dysfunction: testing and clinical relevance. *Circulation* 115:1285–1295
- del Rincon I, O'Leary DH, Haas RW et al (2004) Effect of glucocorticoids on the arteries in rheumatoid arthritis. *Arthritis Rheum* 50:3813–3822
- DeMaria AN (2002) Relative risk of cardiovascular events in patients with rheumatoid arthritis. *Am J Cardiol* 89:33D–38D
- Dhawan V, Handu SS, Nain CK et al (2005) Chronic L-arginine supplementation improves endothelial cell vasoactive functions in hypercholesterolemic and atherosclerotic monkeys. *Mol Cell Biochem* 269:1–11
- Di Minno MN, Ambrosino P, Lupoli R et al (2015) Cardiovascular risk markers in patients with psoriatic arthritis: A meta-analysis of literature studies. *Ann Med* 47:346–353
- Domsic RT, Dezfulian C, Shoushtari A et al (2014) Endothelial dysfunction is present only in the microvasculature and microcirculation of early diffuse systemic sclerosis patients. *Clin Exp Rheumatol* 32(6 Suppl 86):S-154–S-160
- Doria A, Sherer Y, Meroni PL et al (2005) Inflammation and accelerated atherosclerosis: basic mechanisms. *Rheum Dis Clin North Am* 31(355–362):viii
- dos Reis-Neto ET, da Silva AE, Monteiro CM et al (2013) Supervised physical exercise improves endothelial function in patients with systemic lupus erythematosus. *Rheumatology* 52:2187–2195
- El-Magadmi M, Bodill H, Ahmad Y et al (2004) Systemic lupus erythematosus: an independent risk factor for endothelial dysfunction in women. *Circulation* 110:399–404
- Erkan D (2006) Lupus and thrombosis. *J Rheumatol* 33:1715–1717
- Fernandes JL, Mamoni RL, Orford JL et al (2004) Increased Th1 activity in patients with coronary artery disease. *Cytokine* 26:131–137
- Fitzgerald O, Winchester R (2009) Psoriatic arthritis: from pathogenesis to therapy. *Arthritis Res Ther* 11:214
- Forstermann U, Munzel T (2006) Endothelial nitric oxide synthase in vascular disease: from marvel to menace. *Circulation* 113:1708–1714
- Frech T, Walker AE, Barrett-O'Keefe Z et al (2015) Systemic sclerosis induces pronounced peripheral vascular dysfunction characterized by blunted peripheral vasoreactivity and endothelial dysfunction. *Clin Rheumatol* 34:905–913
- Gabrielli A, Avvedimento EV, Krieg T (2009) Scleroderma. *N Engl J Med* 360:1989–2003
- Garg N, Krishan P, Syngle A (2016) Atherosclerosis in psoriatic arthritis: a multiparametric analysis using imaging technique and laboratory markers of inflammation and vascular function. *Int J Angiol* 25:222–228
- George J, Harats D, Gilburd B et al (1999) Immunolocalization of beta2-glycoprotein I (apolipoprotein H) to human atherosclerotic plaques: potential implications for lesion progression. *Circulation* 99:2227–2230
- Ghiadoni L, Huang Y, Magagna A et al (2001) Effect of acute blood pressure reduction on endothelial function in the brachial artery of patients with essential hypertension. *J Hypertens* 19(3 Pt 2):547–551
- Ghiadoni L, Versari D, Magagna A et al (2007) Ramipril dose-dependently increases nitric oxide availability in the radial artery of essential hypertension patients. *J Hypertens* 25:361–366
- Ghiadoni L, Mosca M, Tani C et al (2008) Clinical and methodological aspects of endothelial function in patients with systemic autoimmune diseases. *Clin Exp Rheumatol* 26:680–687
- Giannattasio C, Pozzi M, Gardinali M et al (2007) Effects of prostaglandin E1alpha cyclodextrin [corrected] treatment on endothelial dysfunction in patients with systemic sclerosis. *J Hypertens* 25:793–797
- Gladman DD, Ang M, Su L et al (2009) Cardiovascular morbidity in psoriatic arthritis. *Ann Rheum Dis* 68:1131–1135
- Gonzalez-Juanatey C, Testa A, Garcia-Castelo A et al (2003) HLA-DRB1 status affects endothelial function in treated patients with rheumatoid arthritis. *Am J Med* 114:647–652
- Gonzalez-Juanatey C, Testa A, Garcia-Castelo A et al (2004) Active but transient improvement of endothelial function in rheumatoid arthritis patients undergoing long-term treatment with anti-tumor necrosis factor alpha antibody. *Arthritis Rheum* 51:447–450
- Gonzalez-Juanatey C, Llorca J, Miranda-Filloo JA et al (2007) Endothelial dysfunction in psoriatic arthritis patients without clinically evident cardiovascular disease or classic atherosclerosis risk factors. *Arthritis Rheum* 57:287–293
- Gonzalez-Juanatey C, Llorca J, Vazquez-Rodriguez TR et al (2008) Short-term improvement of endothelial function in rituximab-treated rheumatoid arthritis patients refractory to tumor necrosis factor alpha blocker therapy. *Arthritis Rheum* 59:1821–1824
- Gresele P, Migliacci R, Vedovati MC et al (2009) Patients with primary antiphospholipid antibody syndrome and without associated vascular risk factors present a normal endothelial function. *Thromb Res* 123:444–451
- Guin A, Chatterjee Adhikari M, Chakraborty S et al (2013) Effects of disease modifying anti-rheumatic drugs on subclinical atherosclerosis and endothelial dysfunction which has been detected in early rheumatoid arthritis: 1-year follow-up study. *Semin Arthritis Rheum* 43:48–54

- Hansson GK (2001) Immune mechanisms in atherosclerosis. *Arterioscler Thromb Vasc Biol* 21:1876–1890
- Hardie KL, Kinlay S, Hardy DB et al (1997) Reproducibility of brachial ultrasonography and flow-mediated dilatation (FMD) for assessing endothelial function. *Austr N Z J Med* 27:649–652
- Hashimoto M, Akishita M, Eto M et al (1995) Modulation of endothelium-dependent flow-mediated dilatation of the brachial artery by sex and menstrual cycle. *Circulation* 92:3431–3435
- Hathaway CA, Heistad DD, Piegors DJ et al (2002) Regression of atherosclerosis in monkeys reduces vascular superoxide levels. *Circ Res* 90:277–283
- Hawkey CJ (2001) COX-1 and COX-2 inhibitors. *Best Pract Res Clin Gastroenterol* 15:801–820
- Hollan I, Scott H, Saatvedt K et al (2007) Inflammatory rheumatic disease and smoking are predictors of aortic inflammation: a controlled study of biopsy specimens obtained at coronary artery surgery. *Arthritis Rheum* 56:2072–2079
- Hollan I, Bottazzi B, Cuccovillo I et al (2010) Increased levels of serum pentraxin 3, a novel cardiovascular biomarker, in patients with inflammatory rheumatic disease. *Arthritis Care Res* 62:378–385
- Hsue PY, Scherzer R, Grunfeld C et al (2014) Depletion of B-cells with rituximab improves endothelial function and reduces inflammation among individuals with rheumatoid arthritis. *J Am Heart Assoc* 3:e001267
- Hugh J, Van Voorhees AS, Nijhawan RI et al (2014) From the Medical Board of the National Psoriasis Foundation: the risk of cardiovascular disease in individuals with psoriasis and the potential impact of current therapies. *J Am Acad Dermatol* 70:168–177
- Hurlimann D, Forster A, Noll G et al (2002) Anti-tumor necrosis factor- α treatment improves endothelial function in patients with rheumatoid arthritis. *Circulation* 106:2184–2187
- Jacobsson LT, Knowler WC, Pillemer S et al (1993) Rheumatoid arthritis and mortality. A longitudinal study in Pima Indians. *Arthritis Rheum* 36:1045–1053
- Joannides R, Haefeli WE, Linder L et al (1995) Nitric oxide is responsible for flow-dependent dilatation of human peripheral conduit arteries in vivo. *Circulation* 91:1314–1319
- Joannides R, Etienne I, Iacob M et al (2010) Comparative effects of sirolimus and cyclosporin on conduit arteries endothelial function in kidney recipients. *Transpl Int* 23:1135–1143
- Kerekes G, Soltész P, Szucs G et al (2011) Effects of adalimumab treatment on vascular disease associated with early rheumatoid arthritis. *Isr Med Assoc J* 13:147–152
- Kiss E, Soltesz P, Der H et al (2006) Reduced flow-mediated vasodilation as a marker for cardiovascular complications in lupus patients. *J Autoimmun* 27:211–217
- Kitas GD, Erb N (2003) Tackling ischaemic heart disease in rheumatoid arthritis. *Rheumatology* 42:607–613
- Kosch M, Hausberg M, Suwelack B (2003) Studies on effects of calcineurin inhibitor withdrawal on arterial distensibility and endothelial function in renal transplant recipients. *Transplantation* 76:1516–1519
- Krause D, Schleusser B, Herborn G et al (2000) Response to methotrexate treatment is associated with reduced mortality in patients with severe rheumatoid arthritis. *Arthritis Rheum* 43:14–21
- Landewe RB, van den Borne BE, Breedveld FC et al (2000) Methotrexate effects in patients with rheumatoid arthritis with cardiovascular comorbidity. *Lancet* 355:1616–1617
- Leeson P, Thorne S, Donald A et al (1997) Non-invasive measurement of endothelial function: effect on brachial artery dilatation of graded endothelial dependent and independent stimuli. *Heart* 78:22–27
- Li WQ, Han JL, Manson JE et al (2012) Psoriasis and risk of nonfatal cardiovascular disease in U.S. women: a cohort study. *Br J Dermatol* 166:811–818
- Li J, Wang Y, Wang Y et al (2015) Pharmacological activation of AMPK prevents Drp1-mediated mitochondrial fission and alleviates endoplasmic reticulum stress-associated endothelial dysfunction. *J Mol Cell Cardiol* 86:62–74
- Liang KP, Liang KV, Matteson EL et al (2006) Incidence of non-cardiac vascular disease in rheumatoid arthritis and relationship to extraarticular disease manifestations. *Arthritis Rheum* 54:642–648
- Maas R, Schwedhelm E, Kahl L et al (2008) Simultaneous assessment of endothelial function, nitric oxide synthase activity, nitric oxide-mediated signaling, and oxidative stress in individuals with and without hypercholesterolemia. *Clin Chem* 54:292–300
- Manzi S, Meilahn EN, Rairie JE et al (1997) Age-specific incidence rates of myocardial infarction and angina in women with systemic lupus erythematosus: comparison with the Framingham Study. *Am J Epidemiol* 145:408–415
- Manzi S, Selzer F, Sutton-Tyrrell K et al (1999) Prevalence and risk factors of carotid plaque in women with systemic lupus erythematosus. *Arthritis Rheum* 42:51–60
- Maradit-Kremers H, Nicola PJ, Crowson CS et al (2005) Cardiovascular death in rheumatoid arthritis: a population-based study. *Arthritis Rheum* 52:722–732
- Matsuura E, Kobayashi K, Koike T et al (2002) Autoantibody-mediated atherosclerosis. *Autoimmun Rev* 1:348–353
- Mazzocchi G, Notarsanto I, de Pinto GD et al (2010) Anti-tumor necrosis factor- α therapy and changes of flow-mediated vasodilatation in psoriatic and rheumatoid arthritis patients. *Int Emerg Med* 5:495–500
- McMahon M, Grossman J, FitzGerald J et al (2006) Proinflammatory high-density lipoprotein as a biomarker for atherosclerosis in patients with systemic lupus erythematosus and rheumatoid arthritis. *Arthritis Rheum* 54:2541–2549
- Mercanoglu F, Erdogan D, Oflaz H et al (2004) Impaired brachial endothelial function in patients with primary anti-phospholipid syndrome. *Int J Clin Pract* 58:1003–1007
- Meroni PL, Peyvandi F, Foco L et al (2007) Anti-beta 2 glycoprotein I antibodies and the risk of myocardial infarction in young premenopausal women. *J Thromb Haemost* 5:2421–2428
- Mukherjee D, Nissen SE, Topol EJ (2001) Risk of cardiovascular events associated with selective COX-2 inhibitors. *JAMA* 286:954–959
- Murdaca G, Colombo BM, Cagnati P et al (2012) Endothelial dysfunction in rheumatic autoimmune diseases. *Atherosclerosis* 224:309–317
- Nadareishvili Z, Michaud K, Hallenbeck JM et al (2008) Cardiovascular, rheumatologic, and pharmacologic predictors of stroke in patients with rheumatoid arthritis: a nested, case-control study. *Arthritis Rheum* 59:1090–1096
- O’Leary DH, Bots ML (2010) Imaging of atherosclerosis: carotid intima-media thickness. *Eur Heart J* 31:1682–1689
- Op den Buijs J, Musters M, Verrips T et al (2004) Mathematical modeling of vascular endothelial layer maintenance: the role of endothelial cell division, progenitor cell homing, and telomere shortening. *Am J Physiol Heart Circ Physiol* 287:H2651–H2658
- Orlandi A, Bchaton-Piallat ML, Gabbiani G et al (2006) Aging, smooth muscle cells and vascular pathobiology: implications for atherosclerosis. *Atherosclerosis* 188:221–230
- Peretz A, Leotta DF, Sullivan JH et al (2007) Flow mediated dilation of the brachial artery: an investigation of methods requiring further standardization. *BMC Cardiovasc Disord* 7:11
- Peters MJ, van Halm VP, Voskuyl AE et al (2009) Does rheumatoid arthritis equal diabetes mellitus as an independent risk factor for cardiovascular disease? A prospective study. *Arthritis Rheum* 61:1571–1579

- Pierangeli SS, Chen PP, Raschi E et al (2008) Antiphospholipid antibodies and the antiphospholipid syndrome: pathogenic mechanisms. *Semin Thromb Hemost* 34:236–250
- Pingiotti E, Cipriani P, Marrelli A et al (2007) Surface expression of fractalkine receptor (CX3CR1) on CD4+/CD28 T cells in RA patients and correlation with atherosclerotic damage. *Ann N Y Acad Sci* 1107:32–41
- Ponthieux A, Herbeth B, Drosch S et al (2004) Biological determinants of serum ICAM-1, E-selectin, P-selectin and L-selectin levels in healthy subjects: the Stanislas study. *Atherosclerosis* 172:299–308
- Protogerou AD, Zampeli E, Fragiadaki K et al (2011) A pilot study of endothelial dysfunction and aortic stiffness after interleukin-6 receptor inhibition in rheumatoid arthritis. *Atherosclerosis* 219:734–736
- Rader DJ (2006) Molecular regulation of HDL metabolism and function: implications for novel therapies. *J Clin Invest* 116:3090–3100
- Rahman A, Isenberg DA (2008) Systemic lupus erythematosus. *N Engl J Med* 358:929–939
- Raitakari OT, Celermajer DS (2000) Flow-mediated dilatation. *Br J Clin Pharmacol* 50:397–404
- Rajagopalan S, Somers EC, Brook RD et al (2004) Endothelial cell apoptosis in systemic lupus erythematosus: a common pathway for abnormal vascular function and thrombosis propensity. *Blood* 103:3677–3683
- Ramonda R, Puato M, Punzi L et al (2014) Atherosclerosis progression in psoriatic arthritis patients despite the treatment with tumor necrosis factor- α blockers: a two-year prospective observational study. *Joint Bone Spine* 81:421–425
- Reynolds JA, Robertson AC, Bruce IN et al (2014) Improving cardiovascular outcomes in rheumatic diseases: therapeutic potential of circulating endothelial progenitor cells. *Pharmacol Ther* 142:231–243
- Rodriguez-Rodriguez L, González-Juanatey C, García-Bermúdez M et al (2011) CCR5Delta32 variant and cardiovascular disease in patients with rheumatoid arthritis: a cohort study. *Arthritis Res Ther* 13:R133
- Rollando D, Bezante GP, Sulli A et al (2010) Brachial artery endothelial-dependent flow-mediated dilation identifies early-stage endothelial dysfunction in systemic sclerosis and correlates with nailfold microvascular impairment. *J Rheumatol* 37:1168–1173
- Roman MJ, Shanker BA, Davis A et al (2003) Prevalence and correlates of accelerated atherosclerosis in systemic lupus erythematosus. *N Engl J Med* 349:2399–2406
- Ronda N (2012) Differential impairment of serum cholesterol efflux capacity in patients with rheumatoid arthritis and systemic lupus erythematosus. *Arthritis Rheum* 64:2
- Rosato E, Barbano B, Gigante A et al (2013) Erectile dysfunction, endothelium dysfunction, and microvascular damage in patients with systemic sclerosis. *J Sex Med* 10:1380–1388
- Roustit M, Simmons GH, Baguet JP et al (2008) Discrepancy between simultaneous digital skin microvascular and brachial artery macrovascular post-occlusive hyperemia in systemic sclerosis. *J Rheumatol* 35:1576–1583
- Ruiz-Irastorza G, Crowther M, Branch W et al (2010) Antiphospholipid syndrome. *Lancet* 376:1498–1509
- Schuett H, Luchtefeld M, Grothusen C et al (2009) How much is too much? Interleukin-6 and its signalling in atherosclerosis. *Thromb Haemost* 102:215–222
- Schurgers E, Billiau A, Matthys P (2011) Collagen-induced arthritis as an animal model for rheumatoid arthritis: focus on interferon- γ . *J Interferon Cytokine Res* 31:917–926
- Scott DL, Wolfe F, Huizinga TW (2010) Rheumatoid arthritis. *Lancet* 376:1094–1108
- Sfikakis PP, Papamichael C, Stamatelopoulos KS et al (2007) Improvement of vascular endothelial function using the oral endothelin receptor antagonist bosentan in patients with systemic sclerosis. *Arthritis Rheum* 56:1985–1993
- Sharma SK, Rath M, Sahoo S et al (2016) Assessment of premature atherosclerosis in systemic lupus erythematosus patients with and without nephritis. *Lupus* 25:525–531
- Shechter M, Shechter A, Koren-Morag N et al (2014) Usefulness of brachial artery flow-mediated dilation to predict long-term cardiovascular events in subjects without heart disease. *Am J Cardiol* 113:162–167
- Sherer Y, Shoenfeld Y (2006) Mechanisms of disease: atherosclerosis in autoimmune diseases. *Nat Clin Pract Rheumatol* 2:99–106
- Shoenfeld Y, Gerli R, Doria A et al (2005) Accelerated atherosclerosis in autoimmune rheumatic diseases. *Circulation* 112:3337–3347
- Sidiropoulos PI, Siakka P, Pagonidis K et al (2009) Sustained improvement of vascular endothelial function during anti-TNF α treatment in rheumatoid arthritis patients. *Scand J Rheumatol* 38:6–10
- Silva I, Teixeira A, Oliveira J et al (2015) Endothelial dysfunction and nailfold videocapillaroscopy pattern as predictors of digital ulcers in systemic sclerosis: a cohort study and review of the literature. *Clin Rev Allergy Immunol* 49:240–252
- Sincer I, Kurtoglu E, Yilmaz Çoşkun F et al (2015) Association between serum total antioxidant status and flow-mediated dilation in patients with systemic lupus erythematosus: an observational study. *Anatol J Cardiol* 15:913–918
- Skeoch S, Bruce IN (2015) Atherosclerosis in rheumatoid arthritis: is it all about inflammation? *Nat Rev Rheumatol* 11:390–400
- Sodergren A, Karp K, Boman K et al (2010) Atherosclerosis in early rheumatoid arthritis: very early endothelial activation and rapid progression of intima media thickness. *Arthritis Res Ther* 12:R158
- Sokolove J, Brennan MJ, Sharpe O et al (2013) Brief report: citrullination within the atherosclerotic plaque: a potential target for the anti-citrullinated protein antibody response in rheumatoid arthritis. *Arthritis Rheum* 65:1719–1724
- Soltesz P, Dér H, Kerekes G et al (2009) A comparative study of arterial stiffness, flow-mediated vasodilation of the brachial artery, and the thickness of the carotid artery intima-media in patients with systemic autoimmune diseases. *Clin Rheumatol* 28:655–662
- Soltesz P, Kerekes G, Dér H et al (2011) Comparative assessment of vascular function in autoimmune rheumatic diseases: considerations of prevention and treatment. *Autoimmun Rev* 10:416–425
- Sorensen KE, Celermajer DS, Spiegelhalter DJ et al (1995) Non-invasive measurement of human endothelium dependent arterial responses: accuracy and reproducibility. *Br Heart J* 74:247–253
- Stalc M, Tomsic M, Jezovnik MK et al (2011) Endothelium-dependent and independent dilation capability of peripheral arteries in patients with systemic lupus erythematosus and antiphospholipid syndrome. *Clin Exp Rheumatol* 29:616–623
- Stamatelopoulos KS, Kitas GD, Papamichael CM et al (2009) Atherosclerosis in rheumatoid arthritis versus diabetes: a comparative study. *Arterioscler Thromb Vasc Biol* 29:1702–1708
- Szabo SJ, Sullivan BM, Peng SL et al (2003) Molecular mechanisms regulating Th1 immune responses. *Annu Rev Immunol* 21:713–758
- Szucs G, Tímár O, Szekanecz Z et al (2007) Endothelial dysfunction precedes atherosclerosis in systemic sclerosis—relevance for prevention of vascular complications. *Rheumatology* 46:759–762
- Tabas I, Garcia-Cardena G, Owens GK (2015) Recent insights into the cellular biology of atherosclerosis. *J Cell Biol* 209:13–22
- Taddei S, Ghiadoni L, Virdis A et al (1999) Vasodilation to bradykinin is mediated by an ouabain-sensitive pathway as a

- compensatory mechanism for impaired nitric oxide availability in essential hypertensive patients. *Circulation* 100:1400–1405
- Takahashi T, Asano Y, Amiya E et al (2012) Improvement of endothelial function in parallel with the amelioration of dry cough and dyspnea due to interstitial pneumonia by intravenous cyclophosphamide pulse therapy in patients with systemic sclerosis: a preliminary report of two cases. *Mod Rheumatol* 22:598–601
- Takahashi T, Asano Y, Amiya E et al (2014) Clinical correlation of brachial artery flow-mediated dilation in patients with systemic sclerosis. *Mod Rheumatol* 24:106–111
- Takase B, Uehata A, Akima T et al (1998) Endothelium-dependent flow-mediated vasodilation in coronary and brachial arteries in suspected coronary artery disease. *Am J Cardiol* 82(1535–1539):A7–A8
- Tincani A, Spatola L, Prati E et al (1996) The anti-beta2-glycoprotein I activity in human anti-phospholipid syndrome sera is due to monoreactive low-affinity autoantibodies directed to epitopes located on native beta2-glycoprotein I and preserved during species' evolution. *J Immunol* 157:5732–5738
- Turesson C, McClelland RL, Christianson TJ et al (2007) Severe extra-articular disease manifestations are associated with an increased risk of first ever cardiovascular events in patients with rheumatoid arthritis. *Ann Rheum Dis* 66:70–75
- Uehata A, Lieberman EH, Gerhard MD et al (1997) Noninvasive assessment of endothelium-dependent flow-mediated dilation of the brachial artery. *Vasc Med* 2:87–92
- Uyemura K, Demer LL, Castle SC et al (1996) Cross-regulatory roles of interleukin (IL)-12 and IL-10 in atherosclerosis. *J Clin Invest* 97:2130–2138
- Vaarala O, Alfthan G, Jauhiainen M et al (1993) Crossreaction between antibodies to oxidised low-density lipoprotein and to cardiolipin in systemic lupus erythematosus. *Lancet* 341:923–925
- Vaarala O, Manttari M, Manninen V et al (1995) Anti-cardiolipin antibodies and risk of myocardial infarction in a prospective cohort of middle-aged men. *Circulation* 91:23–27
- Van Doornum S, McColl G, Jenkins A et al (2003) Screening for atherosclerosis in patients with rheumatoid arthritis: comparison of two in vivo tests of vascular function. *Arthritis Rheum* 48:72–80
- van Halm VP, Nurmohamed MT, Twisk JW et al (2006) Disease-modifying antirheumatic drugs are associated with a reduced risk for cardiovascular disease in patients with rheumatoid arthritis: a case control study. *Arthritis Res Ther* 8:R151
- Vanhoutte PM, Shimokawa H, Tang EH et al (2009) Endothelial dysfunction and vascular disease. *Acta Physiol* 196:193–222
- Vaudo G, Marchesi S, Gerli R et al (2004) Endothelial dysfunction in young patients with rheumatoid arthritis and low disease activity. *Ann Rheum Dis* 63:31–35
- Veselinovic MV, Zivkovic VI, Toncev S et al (2012) Carotid artery intima-media thickness and brachial artery flow-mediated vasodilatation in patients with rheumatoid arthritis. *VASA* 41:343–351
- Wang DG, Tang XW, Fan Y et al (2014) Decreased flow-mediated dilatation in patients with systemic lupus erythematosus: a meta-analysis. *Inflammation* 37:2067–2075
- Watanabe J, Charles-Schoeman C, Miao Y et al (2012) Proteomic profiling following immunoaffinity capture of high-density lipoprotein: association of acute-phase proteins and complement factors with proinflammatory high-density lipoprotein in rheumatoid arthritis. *Arthritis Rheum* 64:1828–1837
- Weisman MH, Paulus HE, Burch FX et al (2007) A placebo-controlled, randomized, double-blinded study evaluating the safety of etanercept in patients with rheumatoid arthritis and concomitant comorbid diseases. *Rheumatology* 46:1122–1125
- Wong M, Jiang BY, McNeill K et al (2007) Effects of selective and non-selective cyclo-oxygenase inhibition on endothelial function in patients with rheumatoid arthritis. *Scand J Rheumatol* 36:265–269
- Yilmazer B, Sahin T, Unlu BO et al (2015) Investigation of subclinical atherosclerosis in psoriatic arthritis patients with minimal disease activity. *Rheumatol Int* 35:1385–1392